The Practice of Assessment in Music Education
The Practice of Assessment in Music Education: Frameworks, Models, and Designs

Proceedings of the 2009 Florida Symposium on Assessment in Music Education

University of Florida

Timothy S. Brophy, PhD, Editor
Contents

Acknowledgments ................................................................................................................................. xiii
Introduction ............................................................................................................................................. xv

Part 1  Assessment in State and National Contexts

Many Voices, One Goal: Practices of Large-Scale Music Assessment  
Keynote Address  Richard Colwell ..........3

Assessment in the Arts: An Overview of States’ Practices and Status  
Special Guest Presentation  Linda T. Lovins ..........23

Connecticut’s Common Arts Assessment Initiative: Helping Teachers Improve Music Learning in a Data-Driven School Environment  
Special Guest Presentation  Scott C. Shuler  
Richard Wells ...............43

Investigation of the Multiple-Choice Formats for Assessing Music Notation Reading  
Paper  Ching Ching Yap ..........57

The Development of Competency Models: An IRT-based Approach to Competency Assessment in General Music Education  
Paper  Anne-Katrin Jordan  
Jens Knigge ...............67

The Caribbean Secondary (C-Sec) Music Syllabus: Formulation, Content and Assessment Processes  
Panel Discussion  Lyndel A. Bailey  
Anne M. Osborne  
O’Neal Mundle .............87

Assessment “Over The Ocean” –Outside of the US  
Panel Discussion  Alena V. Holmes  
Dilek Göktürk  
Beatriz E. Aguilar  
Jian-Jun Chen ...............97

The Use of Portfolios in Hiring Music Teacher Process in Taiwan: A Matter of Perspectives by School Administrators and Music Teachers  
Paper  Cheng-Hsien Kao  
Ming-Jen Chuang ......103

Frameworks, Models, and Designs: Key Issues for Assessment in Music Education  
Work Session Summary  Charles J. Vaughan  
David C. Edmund  
Alena V. Holmes  
John P. LaCognata ...... 117
### Part 2  Assessment in Schools and School Districts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assuring the Validity of Teacher-Made Assessments</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Edward P. Asmus</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Assessment as an Impetus for Strategic, Intentional, and Sustainable Growth in the Instrumental Classroom</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Stephen Benham</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Skills Assessments Used in Inner-city Schools: The Education through Music Model</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Leslie Scheuler</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment in Elementary Music Education: One District’s Approach to Authentic Assessment in the Elementary Classroom</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Amy K. Anderson</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Your Curriculum Transparent: Build It and They Will Come</td>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Paul Kimpton</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part 3  Assessment in Music Classrooms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Crucial Role of Aptitudes in Music Instruction</td>
<td>Keynote Address</td>
<td>Edwin E. Gordon</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-Made Tools for Assessing Music Listening</td>
<td>Special Guest Presentation</td>
<td>Keith P. Thompson</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Assessment in the High School Band Ensemble Class</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>John P. LaCognata</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Communicative Function of Behavioral Responses to Music: A Precursor to Assessment for Students with Autism</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Donald DeVito</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanding Higher-Order Thinking in the Music Classroom: Suggestions for Effective and Efficient Assessment</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Dee Hansen</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment 101: Basic Strategies Every Director Should Know for Teaching and Assessing</td>
<td>Paper</td>
<td>Charles Hoffer</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Assessment Practices in the Choral Classroom  
*Panel Discussion*  
Russell L. Robinson  
Lynne Gackle  
William Renfroe  
Ann Usher ..........281

Classroom Assessment Techniques for the Elementary General Music Teacher  
*Strategy*  
Brad Foust ..........287

Assessing Assessment: Examining Habits of Work and Learning and Mastery  
*Strategy*  
Jason Gaines  
Peter Holsberg  
Gianfranco Tornatore ....293

Improving Performance through Authentic Assessment in Early Childhood Classes: Taking Out the Guesswork...Working Towards Data-Informed Decision Making in Kindergarten Music  
*Strategy*  
Denise Ondishko ..........297

Singing Self-Assessment Accuracy of Elementary School Children  
*Paper*  
Patricia E. Riley ..........307

Eye-hand Coordination as a Factor in the Success of Beginning Instrumentalists  
*Paper*  
Glenn E. Nierman  
Angela Nierman  
Bruce Pearson ..........323

Beyond the Classroom: Analyzing Student Work  
*Paper*  
Denese Odegaard ..........335

Assessing Student Learning in Music Performance Class: What Works, What Doesn’t, and What We Can Do about It  
*Strategy*  
Kelly A. Parkes ..........351

**Part 4  Assessment in Higher Education and Music Teacher Education**

Assessing the Concept of Assessment: Some Philosophical Perspectives  
*Keynote Address*  
David J. Elliott ..........367

Aims in the Age of Assessment: A Special Case  
*Paper*  
Marissa Silverman ......381

Self-assessment Strategies for Developing Future Music Teachers  
*Strategy*  
Brian Wuttke ..........391

The Nature of Performance-Based Criterion Measures in Early Childhood Music Education Research, and Related Issues  
*Paper*  
Maria E. Runfola  
Elisabeth A. Etopio .......395
In Search of Models for the Assessment of Thinking in Music Education

Technological Pedagogical and Content Knowledge, Music, and Assessment

The Role of Technology in Assessment of Online Music Education Courses Taught at the Community College Level

Designing Assessment: The Selection and Construction of Instructional Objectives

The Use of Criteria-Specific Performance Rubrics for Student Self-Assessment: A Case Study

The Problem with “No Problem”: Music Teacher Assessment

Constructivist Perspectives of Instruction and Assessment within Instrumental Music Education

Making the Grade: Preservice Teachers and Facilitators for School and Community Music Programs

Theory into Practice: Teaching Assessment Strategies to Pre-service Teachers through a Third-through-Fifth-Grade Vocal Music Laboratory

Part 5 Poster Session Abstracts

The Influence of Statewide Music Testing on Assessment Practices within Elementary Music Classrooms

Challenges of Teaching and Assessing Recorder Playing in Elementary General Music Classes in Taichung City Taiwan

Galileo’s Lute: Assessment through Authentic Performance Tasks in Secondary General Music

In Search of Models for the Assessment of Thinking in Music Education

Technological Pedagogical and Content Knowledge, Music, and Assessment

The Role of Technology in Assessment of Online Music Education Courses Taught at the Community College Level

Designing Assessment: The Selection and Construction of Instructional Objectives

The Use of Criteria-Specific Performance Rubrics for Student Self-Assessment: A Case Study

The Problem with “No Problem”: Music Teacher Assessment

Constructivist Perspectives of Instruction and Assessment within Instrumental Music Education

Making the Grade: Preservice Teachers and Facilitators for School and Community Music Programs

Theory into Practice: Teaching Assessment Strategies to Pre-service Teachers through a Third-through-Fifth-Grade Vocal Music Laboratory

Part 5 Poster Session Abstracts

The Influence of Statewide Music Testing on Assessment Practices within Elementary Music Classrooms

Challenges of Teaching and Assessing Recorder Playing in Elementary General Music Classes in Taichung City Taiwan

Galileo’s Lute: Assessment through Authentic Performance Tasks in Secondary General Music
The Effect of Music Instruction on Preschool Students’ Academic Skills: A Two-Year Study

Poster Session

Daniel C. Johnson ......523

A Study of the Effect of Co-equal Arts Integration on Student Achievement in Music and Writing with Fourth-and-Fifth-Grade Students

Poster Session

Alice Ray Hixson .......525

An Analysis of Relationships Between Lesson Planning Training and Rehearsal Pacing of Undergraduate Instrumental Music Education Majors in Practice Teaching Settings

Poster Session—Abstract

Jeremy S. Lane ...........529

The Musical N-Back (MNB): A Measure of Working Memory in the Musical Domain

Poster Session—Abstract

Jennifer Bugos
Stephen Stalls ..........531

Assessing Elementary Music Teachers’ Perceptions of Effective Interactions

Beth Gibbs .................533

Recruitment and Retention of School-of-Music Students: Strategies Used by Faculty and Administrators of Higher Education

Ashley E. Budde .........535

A Qualitative Analysis of Participant Roles in an Applied Vocal Music Studio

Jeremy S. Lane
Tina M. Stallard.........539
Assessing Assessment: Examining Habits of Work and Learning and Mastery

Jason Gaines  
Peter Holsberg  
Gianfranco Tornatore  
Teachers College, Columbia University, New York, New York

Strategy Paper

Abstract

More often than not, instrumental music programs focus on assessing either content or character. Content refers to the mastery of musical skills, and character refers to the student’s contribution within the classroom community and the personal growth of the student. These domains are rarely combined into a coherent assessment strategy that displays a more comprehensive and clearly defined portrait of student growth and achievement. What would an instrumental music program look like if it assessed both content and character in a manner that was transparent to all stakeholders? At the Washington Heights Expeditionary Learning School (WHEELS) in the urban New York City community of Washington Heights, a model designed to honor the union of content and character in a cohesive strategy has been implemented. The implementation of this strategy has yielded both promises and challenges. This presentation will illustrate the promises and challenges that arose from the implementation of this strategy, along with implications for further research.

Introduction

Far too often, instrumental music programs focus on assessing either content or character (Wendell, 2007). Content refers to the mastery of musical skills, and character refers to the student’s contribution within the classroom community and the personal growth of the student. These domains are rarely combined into a coherent assessment strategy that displays a more comprehensive and clearly defined portrait of student growth and achievement. Few could argue that assessment that is devoid of either domain will result in deep insight into the growth and progress of the student within the classroom community. In doing so, one arguably neglects a valuable tool in assessment
Part 3: Assessment in Music Classrooms

(Abeles, Klotman & Hoffer, 1995). However, because of the difficulty in assessing these areas, music educators have not developed ways to measure both content and character in a manner that is systematic and clear to all stakeholders—teacher, student, administrators, faculty, and parents (Abeles et al., 1995; Hickey, 1997).

What would an instrumental music program look like if it assessed both content and character in a manner that was transparent to all stakeholders? At the Washington Heights Expeditionary Learning School (WHEELS) in the urban New York City community of Washington Heights, a model that attempts to honor the union of content and character in a cohesive strategy has been implemented. The implementation of this strategy has yielded both promises and challenges. This presentation will illustrate the promises and challenges that arose from the implementation of this strategy, along with implications for further research.

Background

Expeditionary Learning builds on the educational insights of Kurt Hahn, the founder of Outward Bound. Expeditionary Learning (EL) schools evolved from an Outward Bound urban education initiative that began in 1992 (Cousins, 2000). EL schools use, as their framework, five core practices and benchmarks. These core practices—learning expeditions, active pedagogy, school culture and character, leadership and school improvement, and structures—work together to promote a learning environment that fosters high student achievement through active learning, character growth, and teamwork.

Assessment is an integral component of the EL philosophy. Both process and product are factored into assessment strategies in the EL classroom. Products, the result of in-depth investigations, are a critical component of the assessment process. “Products are motivational, drive a need to know, and propel students to apply skills” (Expeditionary Learning Core Practice Bookmarks, 2003, p. 12) in order to understand content and concepts. EL refers to character objectives as Habits of Work and Learning (HOWL). In the model that WHEELS has adapted to fit within the requirements of the New York City Department of Education, which requires a single assessment grade per subject, content and character HOWL grades are combined at a 60/40 ratio respectively. This is important to note because the traditional EL model offers separate assessments in content and character.

WHEELS has grown from 180 to nearly 360 students since the school opened in September 2006. It was at this time that the entire faculty at WHEELS engaged in a discussion involving the idea of assessment. Founded on the research of Ken O’Connor (2000), WHEELS has adopted a school wide assessment policy that includes not only the mastery of content objectives, but also includes the HOWL grade. The HOWL grade represents what music teachers have used informally for years. To formalize this practice we, as the music department, designed rubrics and assessment guides to better assess student achievement. Using the EL benchmarks as a means for combating this problem, we found these benchmarks to be very helpful in codifying student expectations and its relationship to assessment.

Some may argue that this codification of expectations is too regimented and is not consistent with the philosophy of a democratic and constructivist classroom. However, in a democratic and constructivist classroom it is essential to establish expectations in order for students to flourish in
a safe environment (Dewey, 1938). Working within the community in a creative way is part of the challenge to both the students and the teacher (Bruner, 1996). Content is negotiable and flexible to meet the desires and needs of the student in a community-based environment (Dewey, 1938); however, the expectations of student participation are somewhat less fluid. This will provide a sense of structure, ultimately facilitating the augmentation of the community learning experience.

Implications

Implementing this assessment strategy poses both promises and challenges. Promises include awareness on the part of the student in regard to academic progress, the habits of work and learning that lead to an understanding of the process and a more refined product, increased communication between the teacher and student (Duckworth, 1996) and through the reflective actions of students throughout the exploratory process of learning (Brookfield, 1987). This strategy allows the teacher to refine their practice by carefully examining, in detail, both the product and process that occurs in their classroom, as well as the amount of objectivity and subjectivity that is being used to assess student performance.

In addition to the promises of implementing such a strategy, challenges arose as well. This strategy is time consuming and requires careful planning. Furthermore, if the implemented structures are ill conceived, both the teacher and the students can experience frustration and fail to meet the stated objectives. As a result, the desired outcome utilizing multiple components to assess student growth and progress will become unfounded. It is clear that further research is needed to investigate fully the promises and challenges posed by assessment strategy.
Part 3: Assessment in Music Classrooms

References